

**Architectural Design Review Board**  
**Tuesday, October 4, 2016**  
**4:30 p.m.**

<b>Planning Commission</b>	<b>At-Large</b>		<b>Council</b>	<b>Chamber of Commerce</b>	<b>Rossville</b>
<b>Tom Alf</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<b>Steve Beckman</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<b>Armand Bloch</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<b>Robert Brown</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<b>Madam Chair</b> <b>Mary Pat Essman</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<b>Pauline Fairbanks</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Joshua Smith				Rob Weigel	Jane Jacobs
<b>SID</b>					
	<b>Dayton Lane</b>	<b>Architect</b>	<b>German Village</b>	<b>Historic Hamilton</b>	
<b>Larry Fiehrer</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<b>Dan Graham</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<b>Todd Palechek</b>	<b>Debbie Ripperger</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<b>Karen Whalen</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Rick Demmel	Thomas O'Neill		Ann Brown	Shi O'Neill	

Staff: Mr. Ed Wilson, Ms. Kathy Dudley (Assistant Law Director), Mrs. Heather Hodges, and Ms. Kim Kirsch.

Guests: Ms. Kris Hartkemeyer, Mr. Bill Wilks, Mr. Taylor Welch, and Mr. Mike Dingeldein.

The meeting was called to order by Madam Chair Essman at 4:30 pm.

**I. Roll Call**

Mr. Tom Alf, Mr. Steve Beckman, Mr. Armond Bloch, Mr. Bob Brown, Madam Chair Mary Pat Essman, Ms. Pauline Fairbanks, Mr. Larry Fiehrer, Mr. Dan Graham, Ms. Debbie Ripperger, and Ms. Karen Whalen.

## **II. Swearing in of Those Providing Testimony to the Board:**

Members in the audience were sworn in by Ms. Kathy Dudley, Assistant Law Director.

## **III. Approval of Meeting Minutes – Written Summary and Audio Recording for these dates:**

- A. September 20, 2016 – Motion to accept by Mr. Fiehrer, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mr. Alf. With all “ayes” except Ms. Whalen (abstain), the Motion passes with a vote of 9-0-1, and the minutes are approved.

## **IV. Properties Seeking COA - Old Business**

### **1. 228 Linden Street (German Village) – Painting**

This item was tabled at the meeting on 9/20/16 and Mr. Wilks was to come back in with different colors than presented at that meeting. He brought the paint samples to this meeting for presentation:

- **Body of the House**
  - **Porter Paint #PPG1190-6, Firecracker**
- **Window Trim, Back Shutters, Fence, Brick on Side and Awning**
  - **Porter Paint #PPG1206-4, Sawdust**
- **Corbels and Doors**
  - **Porter Paint #PPG1121-5, Guacamole**

The paint samples were presented to the Board for their review. After a brief discussion between Mr. Wilks and the Board, Mr. Bloch made a Motion to close the Public Hearing. With a 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mr. Alf and all “ayes” to roll call vote, the Public Hearing was closed.

After a bit more discussion between the Board, Mr. Fiehrer made a Motion to approve the colors as presented. With a 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mr. Bloch and a vote of 6-4 (“no” by Mr. Beckman, Ms. Fairbanks, Ms. Ripperger & Ms. Whalen), the Motion passes and the COA is approved as presented.

## **V Properties Seeking COA - New Business**

### **1. 302 Main Street (Rossville) – Painting**

#### **Introduction:**

The Applicant, Hamilton CORE Fund, has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property of 302 Main Street. The proposal involves painting of the trim for this structure.

The subject property of 302 Main Street is part of the Rossville Historic District and is Zoned MS-1, "Main Street Core, Form-Based Zoning".

#### **Proposal:**

Painting of the Trim in areas as indicated on the structure.

The proposed painting is based on reinstalled stained glass windows of the structure, and the paint scheme of the structure located next door to the subject property.

- **Trim 1:**
  - Existing: Green painted portions of the structure.
  - Proposed: Benjamin Moore "Dark Basalt" 2072-10.
  
- **Trim 2:**
  - Existing: Creme painted portions of the structure.
  - Proposed: Sherwin Williams "Blonde" SW 6128.

Mr. Dingeldein, Director of CORE, was present. He said that they are asking for approval for paint, but they are also asking for approval for restoration of glass. He said that they are replacing the clear transom glass with stained glass windows. He said that they are drawing the color schemes for the building from the stained glass windows and stained glass frames.

After a brief discussion between the Board and Mr. Dingeldein, Mr. Graham made a Motion to close the Public Hearing. With a 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mr. Bloch and all "ayes" to roll call vote, the Public Hearing was closed.

Mr. Bloch made a Motion to approve the COA as presented. With a 2<sup>nd</sup> by Ms. Whalen and all "ayes" to a roll call vote, the Motion passes and the COA is approved.

## **2. 407 North Third Street (*German Village*) – Painting, Window Boxes**

### **Background:**

407 North Third Street was brought to the attention of the Community Development Department, Planning Division, due to an inquiry of painting having occurred on the structure without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Staff investigated and discovered evidence of painting having occurred due to a change of color for both the front door and front porch.

A Notice Letter for dialogue and rectification of the situation was both posted on the front door of the property and mailed to the owner on record, Ms. Kris Hartkemeyer. A COA application was submitted to the Planning office for inclusion in the next available ADRB Agenda for review by the board.

### **Proposal:**

Painting of the front door, back door, porch, Installation of 2 Window Boxes – to be painted the color of the trim, (off-white).

#### **• Painting**

- Front Door and Back Door - Applicant indicates the color is “Lavender”
  - The paint is: “Forever Lilac” SW 9067
- Porch Floor and Base – Applicant indicates the color is “African Violet”
  - The paint is: “African Violet” SW 6982
- Window Boxes – Behr Premium Plus, Pro Behr e-600
  - “Satin White”

Another portion of the proposal includes installation of Window Boxes. Per the Applicant, there is no set time for the installation, and there is an estimated time of installation in Spring of 2017.

#### **• Window Boxes**

- Installation of Two (2) Window Boxes
  - Located on the top front end windows
  - Will be painted to match the trim “Off White”

The applicant indicates that the colors of purple that she chose were appropriate for a turn of the century home.

Ms. Whalen asked what the color of the body of the house was. Mr. Wilson was able to look back in his notes and verified that the color "Umber" was approved for the body of the house on October 20, 2015. He gave the paint number to the Board members, who had the paint swatches available from Sherwin Williams and wanted to see what it was.

The question was then asked what color the house had been prior to that, and Ms. Dudley responded that it was red, and it had previously been scheduled to be demolished before CORE bought it.

Ms. Ripperger (Board representative for German Village) stated that she had four people come to her house and tell her that they didn't like the color that the door was painted.

Madam Chair Essman asked for questions or comments. Ms. Whalen said that to her, she doesn't feel a porch floor is ever something that you really want to draw attention to. She said that she is wondering if the porch floor could be the same as the body of the house (darker, not as noticeable, and would flow well with the stone barricades that are in the front), and then paint the front door a lively color in something that would look welcoming in a "historically accurate way".

Ms. Fairbanks said that while the colors might be "historically accurate", she's not sure about the application of the colors (used as an "accent" color on a column?). She said that she's not sure that it's appropriate as a front door or a porch floor, and she's not sure that it's appropriate for this house and that style of door. She said that she would like to see more evidence of it being used properly in a house of that era before she would approve it on this one.

Ms. Dudley then asked Madam Chair if she was going to ask the Applicant if she wished to address the Board, which Madam Chair Essman did. The Applicant replied that she had nothing to say. Mr. Fiehrer asked the Applicant if she would be agreeable to a COA that had the door staying the same color, but changing the color of the floor to match the color of the house and she replied that she would not, she likes it the way it is.

Mr. Alf stated that he thought that the Board should respect the owner's wishes if they are paying the bill and they are willing to invest in the neighborhood, and that he appreciates their efforts.

Ms. Fairbanks said "personal preferences aside, is it appropriate for the house and the era" is the question." Madam Chair Essman answered that the Board's mission is to try to do the best they can in keeping the historic aura of the neighborhoods, and she believes that Ms. Fairbanks is asking that question, and she doesn't know the answer either. She then asked Mr. Dingeldein if he knew if

the colors in question are appropriate for the era of the house. He replied that turn of the century houses certainly used accent colors on doors, but he doesn't know if there is any precedents for the porch floor.

Mr. Wilson said that thus far, it just seems like it's all "subjective", and nothing has been truly cited as a reason to deny or approve the request.

Mr. Graham asked Mr. Dingeldein what he thought the architectural style of the house was, and Mr. Dingeldein replied "Federal, early 1900's Federal Style".

Madam Chair Essman asked if there were any additional comments or questions, and Ms. Ripperger reiterated that she had 4 people come down and say they did not like it, but she understands that everyone has their own personal opinion.

Mr. Graham asked Mr. Wilson to pull up a street view on Google Earth and show the surrounding properties for the Board to look at. Mr. Wilson was able to locate one of Mr. Wilks' properties where he had painted a door purple next to 342 N. 3<sup>rd</sup> Street. Ms. Whalen said that she thought the color was called "Blueberry, but it turned out to be more of a purple color".

Mr. Graham stated that he thought the two colors would work if the style were a "Queen Ann Victorian style" home and it were to be replicated as a "Painted Lady", but he's just not sure that the colors blend well with the body of the house.

With no further questions, Mr. Brown made a Motion to close the Public Hearing. With a 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mr. Bloch and all "ayes" to a roll call vote, the Public Hearing was closed.

Madam Chair Essman asked the Board what they would like to do. Ms. Fairbanks stated that she doesn't think the colors are appropriate for the particular house. Ms. Whalen said that she agrees with Mr. Graham that the colors would be more appropriate on a Queen Anne and a Painted Lady look. She went on to say that she thinks other colors would be more historically accurate on the body of the house and enhance the look of the house.

Mr. Fiehrer advised the Board that he would be abstaining on a vote to any Motion, as he knows the Applicant on a professional basis.

Mr. Brown made a Motion to approve the colors as presented, with a 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mr. Alf. With a roll call vote of 2-7-1, the Motion was denied. (Mr. Beckman, Mr. Bloch, Madam Chair Essman, Ms. Fairbanks, Mr. Graham, Ms. Ripperger, and Ms. Whalen all voted "no", Mr. Fiehrer abstained).

Madam Chair Essman asked Mr. Wilson if he would work with the Applicant to try to come up with some colors that would work, and he said that he would. Ms. Dudley stated that the Applicant would be notified of the Board's decision

formally, and Mr. Wilson advised the Applicant that she would be receiving the formal notification within 5 days.

**VI Miscellaneous/Discussion/On the Radar**

Property Inquiries Like-for-Like COA

- o 327 North Second Street (German Village) – Garage Roof - Like-for-Like COA
- o 1024 Campbell Avenue (Dayton-Campbell) – Rear Porch Work - Like-for-Like COA

The next tentative meeting is set for October 18, 2016.

**VI. Adjourn**

Mr. Brown made a Motion to adjourn. With a 2<sup>nd</sup> by Mr. Graham, the meeting is adjourned.

Submitted by:

Chair:



Ed Wilson  
Secretary, ADRB



Mary Pat Essman  
Madam Chair, ADRB

ACTS

