

Architectural Design Review Board
Tuesday, April 5, 2016
4:33 p.m.

Planning Commission	At-Large		Council	Chamber of Commerce	Rossville
VACANT	Steve Beckman <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Armand Bloch <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Robert Brown <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Madam Chair Mary Pat Essman	Pauline Fairbanks <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Tom Alf <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				Rob Weigel <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Jane Jacobs
SID	Dayton Lane	Architect	German Village	Historic Hamilton	
Larry Fiehrer <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Dan Graham	Todd Palechek <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Debbie Ripperger <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Karen Whalen <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Rick Demmel	Thomas O'Neill <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		Ann Brown	Shi O'Neill	

Staff: Ed Wilson, City of Hamilton; Heather Hodges, City of Hamilton; Kim Kirsch, City of Hamilton; John Creech, City of Hamilton; Kathy Dudley, City of Hamilton

Guests: Jane Jacobs, Missy McCall, Myra Hargrove

The meeting was called to order by Mr. Ed Wilson, Secretary, at 4:33 pm.

I. Roll Call:

Mr. Alf, Mr. Beckman, Mr. Bloch, Mr. Brown, Mr. Weigel, Ms. Fairbanks, Mr. Fiehrer, Mr. O'Neill, Mr. Palechek, Ms. Ripperger, and Ms. Whalen were present.

A Motion was made by Ms. Whalen to appoint Mr. Fiehrer as Acting Chairman for the meeting. With a 2nd by Mr. Alf and all "ayes", the Motion passes.

II. Swearing in of Those Providing Testimony to the Board:

Members of the audience wishing to speak were sworn in by Ms. Kathy Dudley, Assistant Law Director.

III. Approval of Meeting Minutes – Written Summary and Audio Recording for these dates:

- A. February 2, 2016 – Motion to accept by Ms. Whalen, 2nd by Ms. Ripperger. All “ayes”, except Mr. O’Neill (abstain, not present for meeting).
- B. March 15, 2016- Motion to accept by Mr. Palechek, 2nd by Mr. Alf. All “ayes”, with a change of name from “Mr. Whalen” in minutes to “Ms. Whalen, except for Mr. Fiehrer, Mr. O’Neill, and Mr. Bloch (abstain, not present for meeting).

IV. Old Business - Properties Seeking COA

Agenda Item # 1- 337 Ross Avenue

All pertinent information (including Introduction and Background) was given to the Board prior to the meeting held on the 5th of April, 2016. The Applicant, Doris (Missy) McCall was present for said meeting.

Ms. McCall said that she currently owns 9 historic homes in Hamilton, Ohio. She reiterated that when she bought the house, she checked and was told that the house was not historic. She found out later that it was, after she had replaced the windows.

State of Ohio Historic Designation

This property of 337 Ross Avenue is part of the State of Ohio Historic Inventory, referenced as BUT-580-9. Additionally, the structure is on the National Historic Register, due primarily to its inclusion in the original Rossville Historic District.

Proposal

Per the Applicant’s Submitted Document of Additional Window Options and Costs:

Option1: Window Replacement using Existing Pockets as Wood

Replacement of 26 Windows at Ross Avenue and Hueston Street street fronts, with windows as Wooden 2 lite over 1 lite, sized to match original. Using existing pockets within the structure.

(\$31,200.00 Cost: Materials and Labor)

Option 2: Window Replacement as Wood

Option: Replacement of 26 Windows at Ross and Hueston street fronts, with windows as Wooden 2 lite over 1 lite, sized to match the original.

(\$39,000.00 Cost: Materials and Labor)

Option 3: Surface Mounted Simulated Grids

Option: Install Surface Mounted, Simulated Divided Light Grids on 26 Windows at the Ross and Hueston Street fronts.

(\$3,700.00 Cost: Materials and Labor)

Proposal (Continued)

Additionally, Per Applicant's revised proposal for 337 Ross Avenue.

If the Surface Mounted Window Grid option is approved, then the Applicant also proposes the following:

Painting of the Structure

- White Trim proposed for the Corbels found at the upper roof expression/soffit.
- Sherwin Williams, SW 0006 "Toile Red", proposed for the Accent, such as the upper roof expression and porch upper expression.
- Sherwin Williams, SW 2804 "Renwick Rose Beige", proposed for the Body.
- Per the Applicant, the proposed scheme references "Victorian Exterior Decoration" by Roger Moss and Gail Winkler, as well as "Century of Color: Exterior Decoration for American Buildings 1820-1920" by Roger Moss.
- Applicant Submitted diagrams depicting paint proposal is included as Exhibit Attachment Items.

Decorative Railings for Front Porches

- Per Applicant Submitted items, the new Porch Railing appears to be White Wood, with balustrades.

Ms. Dudley advised Acting Chair Fiehrer that Ms. Jacobs would like to speak on the matter. He advised that the Board could hear from her after Ms. McCall had finished with anything else she might have to say in support of her request.

Ms. McCall reiterated her ownership of other properties in Hamilton and said that to put \$30,000 of windows in a \$90,000 house is a huge waste of money to her. She would rather use that money to make other improvements to house that are more visually different. She said that if there is anything that anyone finds to be more attractive, she is open to all suggestions.

After a discussion between Ms. Fairbanks, Ms. McCall, and Ms. Hargrove about numerous items (including which shade of white she was picking and location for same, the color of the balustrades, the color of the lentils and sills), Ms. Jacobs proposed the following compromise:

1. Put a window that fits where the two windows are on the front of house that don't match the size of the opening (has vinyl panels).
2. Leave vinyl windows in and make the body of the house a darker color, the lentils a medium color and the trim (windows & sashes) a lighter color. She then gave the specific colors that she recommended. Ms. Whalen asked for the colors to be shown to the Applicant and then passed around to the Board for review.

Mr. Beckman asked Mr. Wilson if there are any pictures of the original color of the house, and Mr. Wilson answered his question. Ms. McCall said that in answer to Ms. Jacobs' request to bring the front windows all the way to the floor, she has been told over and over not to bring them to the floor because of code. Ms. Fairbanks gave her opinion of what the code is with regard to that (it has to be tempered), and they had a conversation about that. The Board members then had a bit more discussion about which option they believe Ms. McCall is asking to go with, and Mr. Fiehrer confirmed with Ms. McCall that she didn't want to go with any of the options, she just wants to put the money into exterior changes to the house.

Ms. Dudley said that she believes that the application was to paint, and gave her opinion as to what transpired after that with regard to the COA and the windows. She said that there was not a Motion by Ms. McCall to get a COA for the windows. That was brought up in the course of the earlier hearing because there was no COA on those. Ms. Dudley then went into what her understanding was of what Ms. McCall had actually applied to the ADRB to do (porch, railing).

There was more discussion between Ms. Hargrove, Ms. McCall and the Board about the "Stop Work Order" (what that pertained to), and if the vinyl windows were a part of the Stop Work Order. Mr. Wilson said that they were not, and Ms. Dudley gave the sequence of events that led to the options being given for the windows, and Mr. Fiehrer weighed in on that. Ms. Jacobs and Ms. Whalen then gave their opinions of the procedure, and Mr. Fiehrer reiterated what the "Board" can do about specific situations, vs. what the "City" can do.

Ms. McCall then gave her recollection of the timeline and events that happened at the property and Ms. Jacobs gave hers.

Mr. Brown verified with Mr. Palechek that the lower sash would have to be tempered if it was not 18" from the sill to the porch. He told Ms. McCall that she could probably order a lower sash from Gilkey that would fit.

Ms. Whalen offered a compromise of Ms. McCall doing the 2 windows with tempered glass at the bottom and the Applicant to go with Option 3 on the windows and paint colors.

Acting Chair Fiehrer asked Ms. McCall if she would be willing to accept Option 3 as part of the COA with the condition that work be done on the front windows, and then they can move on to the paint and she said that she would.

After a small amount of conversation between the Board members, Mr. Brown made a Motion to Close the Public Hearing. With a 2nd by Mr. Alf, and a roll call vote of all "ayes", the Public hearing was closed.

Ms. Fairbanks made a Motion to approve 26 windows, 2 front windows on Ross Avenue side to go to the porch floor as they were originally with tempered glass in the lower sash. With a 2nd by Mr. Bloch and all "ayes", the Motion passes.

Mr. Brown made a Motion to close the Public Hearing. With a 2nd by Mr. Alf, the Public Hearing was closed, and the Board entered into a discussion about the windows.

With regard to the paint, Mr. Beckman asked Ms. McCall if she still wants to paint the house, and she said that she did. With the Applicant's approval (by nodding) of Ms. Whalen picking the colors (with help by other board members), Ms. Whalen made a Motion to accept the paint colors of "Sheraton Sage" for the body of the house, "Downing Sand" for the trim, and "Classic Light buff" for the window trim and balustrades.

Mr. Fiehrer verified with Ms. McCall that she understands the colors that have been picked.

Ms. McCall said that she would like to state to the Board that she spent many hours going over the books looking at colors, and for the Board to tell her what color to paint her house is overstepping their boundaries. She said that this has been a hard process and she will paint the house the colors that they picked, but she hopes that the Board doesn't treat the next person the same. She said that she believes that they have a dedication to the community, a dedication to the homes in the community, but there should also be a dedication to the people that are improving them and give them some grace. She added that she wants people to want to come to the historic districts of Hamilton to improve them, but if this is the way they get treated, it's hard. She would like the Board to think about her words to them and she expounded a little further on the matter.

Ms. Whalen said that the Board really does take pride in trying to assist people, and they have succeeded in many cases. While Ms. McCall has done this type of work before, not everyone has and they can use the help (alternative products that might be cheaper, etc). She finished up by saying that the Board doesn't

just “rule”, they are there to genuinely try to help historic home owners with their expertise.

Mr. Alf told Ms. McCall that he's new to the Board, that he came onto the board after this whole process started with her property, and that he very much appreciates her investing in Hamilton. He said that he's worked in the school system for 47 years, many of their families rent from her, and she is providing a service to the community and he appreciates that.

With a Motion and 2nd, the Public Hearing was closed back out. With all ayes except for Mr. Brown (who left at 5:24), the public hearing was closed out.

Acting Chair Fiehrer asked that the new colors that were selected be read into the public record, and same was done by Ms. Kirsch. Ms. Whalen made a Motion to accept the colors as read, with a 2nd by Mr. Weigel. With no further discussion by the Board and all “ayes” by roll call vote, the Motion passes.

Ms. Dudley advised Acting Chair Fiehrer that there was also an issue of the porch rail. He read part of the Application out loud, and it was concluded after some conversation that the porch rail going up the steps to the porch was from a different ADRB meeting. Ms. McCall stated that that the ones that were there were temporary and for a tenant that needed them, and that COA was approved. She said that she wishes to do nothing further with regard to the Porch Railing, and she left the meeting.

Mr. Bloch said that he thought that the balustrades were going to go around the curved porch, and Mr. Wilson advised him that the Applicant withdrew that item.

V. New Business - Properties Seeking COA

Agenda Item # 1– 427 Main Street

Introduction:

The Applicant, Patrick Reist, has submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness Application for the property of 427 Main Street. The proposal involves the Installation of Sign Panels onto Existing Sign Pole.

The subject property of 427 Main Street is part of the State Historic Inventory and is Zoned “MS-1”, Main Street Core - Form-Based Zoning District.

Proposal

- Installation of New Sign Panels onto Existing Sign Pole at property.
- Sign is Non-Illuminated.
- Signage Measures 42 inches in Length and 38 inches in Height. ¼ inch Thick.
- Sign is White, Polymetal Panels installed on 2-inch by 2-inch Treated Wood sign frame.
- Signage color theme consists of Vinyl:
 - Red color Font;
 - Black color outline of signage's font.
- The sign references the name of business and contact phone number.
- An applicant submitted diagram is included as an Exhibit Attachment item for reference.

The Applicant is not present. Acting Chair Fiehrer opened the discussion up to the Board.

After discussion by the Board regarding a number of things about the proposed sign (including the proposed color, design, and whether or not it is in keeping with the historic theme), and with input from Mr. Creech, Mr. Weigel made a Motion to close the Public Hearing. With a 2nd by Mr. Alf and all "ayes" by roll call, the Public Hearing was closed.

Mr. Alf made a Motion to approve the COA as submitted. With a 2nd by Mr. Palechek, roll call was taken. With a vote of 8-2 (Fairbanks & Whalen – no), the Motion passes.

VI. Miscellaneous/Discussion/On the Radar

- Stop Work Order: 323 Park Avenue – Porch
- Property Inquiries:
 - 1306 Hanover Street – Like-for-Like COA
 - 402 North Third Street – Like-for-Like COA
 - 307 Ross Avenue – Like-for-Like COA
- Building Doctor –April 21st for the Free Seminar (Register at building-doctor.org)

Acting Chair Fiehrer and Mr. Wilson had a conversation about the next BZA meeting, which has an item from the ADRB on it (117 Village Street).

VII. Adjourn

With nothing further to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.

Submitted by:

Chair:



Ed Wilson
Secretary, ADRB



Mr. Larry Fiehrer
Acting Chair, ADRB

